THE JOURNEY FROM PERSECUTION TO INCLUSION: A CASE STUDY OF THE CHURCH OF JESUS CHRIST OF LATTER-DAY SAINTS IN AMERICA

Brett G. Scharffs*

ABSTRACT

In studying the experiences of minority religious communities that suffer social hostility, discrimination, persecution, and sometimes even worse forms of ill-treatment up to and including forced migrations and genocide, certain themes and patterns recur in remarkably similar and reliable ways. This Essay suggests that it is often the very same institutions, and people within those institutions, that are the primary sources of persecution, while also being the institutions, and (often different) people within those institutions, who come to the aid of persecuted religious minorities to help them make the transition from persecution to inclusion and participation in society.

This contribution is a brief summary of the journey from persecution to inclusion of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints in the United States. It focuses on seven specific institutions and their inhabitants—the state, majority faiths, the media, the persecuted group themselves, businesses, neighbors, and academia—and the roles they have played both in the problem of persecution and the solutions to that problem.

INTRODUCTION

Several years ago I was invited by Baroness Emma Nicholson of Winterbourne from the House of Lords in the United Kingdom, founder and Chair of the AMAR Foundation, a charity that strives to

^{© 2022} Brett G. Scharffs. Individuals and nonprofit institutions may reproduce and distribute copies of this Essay in any format at or below cost, for educational purposes, so long as each copy identifies the author, provides a citation to the *Notre Dame Law Review Reflection*, and includes this provision in the copyright notice.

^{*} Rex E. Lee Chair and Professor of Law & Director of the International Center for Law and Religion Studies, J. Reuben Clark Law School, Brigham Young University. BSBA, MA, Georgetown University; B.Phil, Oxford University; JD, Yale Law School.

Heartfelt thanks to the *Notre Dame Law Review*, and in particular Micah Allred, Vincent Marrazzo, and Aiste Zalepuga, for the invitation to participate in this Symposium, *Re-Thinking the Law to Protect Religious Minorities*, and for their editorial assistance and patience. Thanks also to Professor Rick Garnett and the Notre Dame Law School's Religious Liberty Initiative. Numerous BYU law students have contributed to the research involved in the larger persecution to inclusion project, as well as on this Essay, including Ryan Cheney, Kimberley Farnsworth, Diana Flores Kaleigh Hostetter, Cody Humpherys, Tom Withers, and Chery Yang.

build and improve "the lives and livelihoods of some of the world's poorest and most disadvantaged people,"¹ to participate in a conference in Baghdad, Iraq, focusing on the latest wave of persecution faced by the Yazidi people, a minority religion that has suffered a long history of misunderstanding, persecution, and attempted genocides.² Along with several ecclesiastical and humanitarian leaders from the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints,³ we were asked to share the experience of the journey from persecution to participation and inclusion of the Latter-day Saints in America, with the hope that there might be ideas or insights that could assist the Yazidi people in navigating their journey. This Essay is a summary version of a chapter that David Kirkham and I are writing for a book about the journey from persecution to inclusion that has emerged from our work with the AMAR Foundation.⁴

At the conference in Baghdad, I heard the account of young Yazidi girls who had been taken captive and sold into sexual slavery, often handed from "husband" to "husband" over the course of several months. One girl thought she recognized one of her oppressors, and although it took some time for her to connect the dots, she came to realize the man who was raping her had been her family's dentist. This story illustrated that religious persecution is not something abstract that occurs far from home, it is people whose lives intersect with their victims—neighbors—who are often the persecutors. And it will also

3 Elder Anthony D. Perkins of the Quorum of the Seventy of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, and Sharon Eubank, President of LDS Charities, the Church's humanitarian aid organization, also participated in the conference in Baghdad, and my thinking about the journey from persecution to inclusion is deeply indebted to, and builds upon, the presentations they made at that conference. *See Latter-day Saint Leaders Discuss Religious Intolerance at Baghdad Conference*, THE CHURCH OF JESUS CHRIST OF LATTER-DAY SAINTS (Nov. 30, 2018), https://newsroom.churchofjesuschrist.org/article/latter-day-saint-leaders-discuss-religious-intolerance-baghdad-conference [https://perma.cc/QPR4-X5EC].

4 This Essay is an abbreviated version of a chapter that David Kirkham and I are writing as part of a book on the journey from persecution to inclusion that is underway and builds upon the work of Baroness Emma Nicholson of the U.K. House of Lords and the AMAR Foundation on contemporary issues involving religious persecution, including the Yazidi community in Iraq. We are indebted to Baroness Nicholson's leadership in seeking ways to assist religious communities who are persecuted today to travel their journeys from persecution to inclusion. Dave Kirkham is a Senior Fellow of the International Center for Law and Religion Studies, who currently resides in the United Arab Emirates, where he works on religious freedom and church humanitarian projects. His contributions to the larger project make him in essence a coauthor of this synopsis as well.

¹ See AMAR FOUND., https://www.amarfoundation.org/ [https://perma.cc/TWU3-5MQ2].

² See AMAR Conference for Yazidi People, BYU L., INT'L CTR. FOR L. & RELIGIOUS STUD. (Nov. 2018), https://classic.iclrs.org/index.php?pageId=1&contentId=1&blurbId=103632 [https://perma.cc/ANJ6-XP2J].

often be neighbors who are the ones who offer support and aid to those suffering from persecution.

I. KEY EVENTS IN THE LATTER-DAY SAINTS'S PERSECUTION AND FORCED MIGRATION

The story of the Latter-day Saints began during a time of religious fervor in the Spring of 1820 when a young boy named Joseph Smith claimed receiving a vision of God the Father and Jesus Christ responding to his prayerful inquiry about which church he should join.⁵ He was told to join none,⁶ and he would be an instrument in restoring the Church of Jesus Christ to the earth.⁷ Joseph was almost immediately subject to bitter persecution by neighbors and local clergy due to his profession of heavenly manifestations.⁸ A decade later, the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints was organized under New York law.⁹

Over the next seventeen years, intense religious persecution resulted in four major forced migrations of Church members.¹⁰ Thousands of people walked thousands of miles to find refuge from religious persecution and to exercise religious freedom.¹¹ In 1831, Church members were forced to move westward from New York and settle in Ohio, where work on a sacred temple began in Kirtland.¹²

8 Joseph Smith—History, THE PEARL OF GREAT PRICE 1:22 ("I soon found, however, that my telling the story had excited a great deal of prejudice against me among professors of religion, and was the cause of great persecution, which continued to increase; and though I was an obscure boy, only between fourteen and fifteen years of age, and my circumstances in life such as to make a boy of no consequence in the world, yet men of high standing would take notice sufficient to excite the public mind against me, and create a bitter persecution; and this was common among all the sects—all united to persecute me.").

9 See 1 SAINTS: THE STORY OF THE CHURCH OF JESUS CHRIST IN THE LATTER DAYS; THE STANDARD OF TRUTH: 1815–1846, at 79–86 (2018) [hereinafter THE STANDARD OF TRUTH]; An Act to Provide for the Incorporation of Religious Societies, 1813 N.Y. Laws 212–19 (repealed 1897).

10 See THE STANDARD OF TRUTH, supra note 9, at 418 (noting forced emigration from Ohio), 376–78 (documenting forced emigration from Missouri); RICHARD LYMAN BUSHMAN, JOSEPH SMITH: ROUGH STONE ROLLING, 370–74 (2005) (noting the departure from New York after threats on church leaders' lives); DALLIN H. OAKS & MARVIN S. HILL, CARTHAGE CONSPIRACY: THE TRIAL OF THE ACCUSED ASSASSINS OF JOSEPH SMITH, 197–99, 205–06 (1975) (noting the forced emigration from Illinois).

11 See, e.g., OAKS & HILL, supra note 10, at 198; THE STANDARD OF TRUTH, supra note 9, at 299.

^{5 1} JOSEPH SMITH, HISTORY OF THE CHURCH OF JESUS CHRIST OF LATTER-DAY SAINTS, 1, 5–6, 14–20 (2d ed. 1974) [hereinafter SMITH, HISTORY].

⁶ Id. at 6.

⁷ The First Presidency & Council of the Twelve Apostles of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, The Restoration of the Fulness of the Gospel of Jesus Christ: A Bicentennial Proclamation to the World \P 3 (2020).

¹² See BUSHMAN, supra note 10, at 124–26.

Persecution of Church leaders and members in Ohio soon became intense,¹³ and in 1838, Church members remaining in Kirtland fled to Missouri,¹⁴ where other Latter-day Saints had begun to gather in 1831.¹⁵ However, by 1838, Saints in Missouri had already endured much violent persecution by hostile neighbors who had driven them from their land, destroyed their property, and physically attacked them.¹⁶ In October 1838, Missouri Governor Lilburn Boggs issued an "Extermination Order" that declared "the Mormons must be treated as enemies and must be exterminated or driven from the state."¹⁷ Emboldened by the sanction of law, persecution in Missouri increased,¹⁸ and a mob massacred seventeen Latter-day Saint men at Hawn's Mill.¹⁹ Joseph Smith and several close associates were imprisoned in the ironically named "Liberty Jail," where they suffered a bitter winter, while Church members were forced to flee the state.²⁰

In 1839, Church members began to turn marshland on the bank of the Mississippi River into a beautiful city, Nauvoo.²¹ Once again, work began on a sacred temple.²² By 1844, persecution raged anew.²³ The governor of Illinois placed Joseph Smith in jail, where he and his brother Hyrum were murdered by a mob covered in blackface while ostensibly under state protection.²⁴ Latter-day Saints consider Joseph and Hyrum to be martyrs for their faith.²⁵

In 1845, in the face of continued persecution, Church members abandoned their homes in Nauvoo and traveled west under the leadership of Brigham Young.²⁶ Their forced migration took them to Utah, where they arrived in 1847.²⁷ Over the next two decades, tens of thousands of Latter-day Saints migrated by wagon and foot to the Utah

17 Letter from Lilburn W. Boggs to John B. Clark (Oct. 27, 1838) (on file with Missouri State Archives: Mormon War Papers); THE STANDARD OF TRUTH, *supra* note 9, at 346.

- 19 See id. at 348-50, 355.
- 20 See id. at 369-72, 374, 376-78, 384-85.
- 21 See id. at 399-401, 417.
- 22 See id. at 420, 426, 430–32.
- 23 See id. at 466, 474–75, 478, 521, 526–28, 530–34, 536–38.
- 24 See id. at 544-45, 547, 550-52.

25 See THE DOCTRINE AND COVENANTS OF THE CHURCH OF JESUS CHRIST OF LATTER-DAY SAINTS § 135:1, 3 (2013) ("[W]e announce the martyrdom of Joseph Smith the Prophet, and Hyrum Smith the Patriarch... [Joseph] lived great, and he died great in the eyes of God and his people; and like most of the Lord's anointed in ancient times, has sealed his mission and his works with his own blood; and so has his brother Hyrum.").

26 OAKS & HILL, *supra* note 10, at 197–99, 205–06.

27 2 SAINTS: THE STORY OF THE CHURCH OF JESUS CHRIST IN THE LATTER DAYS; NO UNHALLOWED HAND: 1846–1893, at 64–66 (2020) [hereinafter NO UNHALLOWED HAND].

¹³ See, e.g., THE STANDARD OF TRUTH, supra note 9, at 149-52.

¹⁴ See id. at 299, 313, 319.

¹⁵ See id. at 125–28.

¹⁶ See id. at 175–80, 182–84.

¹⁸ See, e.g., THE STANDARD OF TRUTH, supra note 9, at 356, 361-64, 372.

territory.²⁸ Because of the hardships and deprivations of the trail, many buried family members on the prairie.²⁹

Even after arriving in Utah, the Church and its members suffered persecution at the hands of the U.S. government. In 1857, based upon false rumors, the President of the United States sent the U.S. Army to Utah to put down an alleged but nonexistent rebellion.³⁰ During the late 1880s, Congress passed laws to break the Church financially, due partly to some Church members' practice of polygamy, and placed Church leaders in prison, culminating in a Supreme Court case upholding the seizure of the Church's property and assets.³¹

In 1890, the Church formally renounced the practice of polygamy,³² and over the following generation, it was discontinued by the main Church, although small groups of excommunicated Latterday Saints continued the practice in a variety of small fundamentalist breakoff sects.³³

As this brief sketch illustrates, for more than seventy-five years, the Church suffered severe persecution. The answer to the question, "why," is complex, and mostly beyond the scope of this Essay. Factors included differences in religious beliefs,³⁴ differences in religious

28 Pioneer Trek, THE CHURCH OF JESUS CHRIST OF LATTER-DAY SAINTS, https://www.churchofjesuschrist.org/study/history/topics/pioneer-trek?lang=eng [https://perma.cc/3ABU-E9H9]. The transcontinental railroad was completed in 1869, with the two lines meeting in Promontory, Utah, after which the majority of emigration shifted to rail. *Railroad*, THE CHURCH OF JESUS CHRIST OF LATTER-DAY SAINTS, https://www.churchofjesuschrist.org/study/history/topics/railroad?lang=eng [https://perma.cc/D687-UJMZ].

29 The Willie and Martin pioneer companies, for example, tragically lost over two hundred members combined. Christine T. Cox, Mormon Pioneer Emigration Facts, THE OF ESUS CHRIST OF LATTER-DAY SAINTS (Mar. 6, 2018). CHURCH https://history.churchofjesuschrist.org/blog/mormon-pioneer-emigration-facts?lang=eng [https://perma.cc/3R7U-NCO2]. Though lower than that experienced by these groups, the average death rate among the 60,000-70,000 Latter-day Saint pioneers that trekked to Utah was still significant-about 3%. See id.

30 NO UNHALLOWED HAND, *supra* note 27, at 247, 250–51, 274, 278–80, 282–83.

31 The Manifesto and the End of Plural Marriage, THE CHURCH OF JESUS CHRIST OF LATTER-DAY SAINTS, https://www.churchofjesuschrist.org/study/manual/gospel-topics-essays/the-manifesto-and-the-end-of-plural-marriage?lang=eng [https://perma.cc/5PQD-3L37].

32 See Wilford Woodruff, Official Declaration: Prohibiting Plural Marriages, in MANIFESTO OF THE PRESIDENCY AND APOSTLES ISSUED DECEMBER 12, 1889. ALSO THE OFFICIAL DECLARATION OR MANIFESTO: PROHIBITING FURTHER PLURAL MARRIAGES, AND ITS ADOPTION BY THE GENERAL CONFERENCE, OCTOBER 6, 1890, at 1, 4 (1890) (originally referred to as "the Manifesto").

33 See The Manifesto and the End of Plural Marriage, supra note 31.

34 Theological differences included different views about the nature of God, additional scripture, most notably the Book of Mormon, and a leadership structure that was viewed as dangerously hierarchical, with one man recognized as a living Prophet.

practices,³⁵ fears of political influence,³⁶ economic jealousy and greed,³⁷ and the negative influence of media caricatures of the Church and its leaders.³⁸

II. SOURCES OF PERSECUTION AND SUPPORT

Consider some of the important institutions in society that may be sources of persecution or sources of support and aid to those suffering from persecution: 1) the state (including law, policy, police, political parties, politicians, courts and judges, prisons, and guards, to name a few); 2) other religious communities, including dominant faiths; 3) the media, including newspapers, magazines, political cartoons, and fictional accounts in magazines and books, and in today's world all online sources; 4) the persecuted group themselves; 5) businesses; 6) neighbors; and 7) academics.

The questions that have interested me are, "Are these institutions the cause or the cure to persecution? And since institutions are created and controlled by people, are those people the cause or the cure to persecution?" Perhaps unsurprisingly, the answer is "both." Perhaps somewhat more surprising is how influential these institutions and the people who inhabit them have been—and are—as both the source of and the solution to persecution.

A. The State

Historically, the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints has experienced persecution and prejudice by the U.S. government at the local, state, and federal levels. In the early years, local and state governments perpetuated persecution against the Saints, either by failing to provide legal protections or by illegally wielding institutional powers against them.³⁹

³⁵ Differences in religious practices included a different understanding of holy spaces, with an emphasis on building Temples; a health code that prohibited tobacco, alcohol, coffee, and tea; and the practice of polygamy, a practice that was abandoned by the church in the 1890s.

³⁶ Latter-day Saints tended to gather in communities for support and to build "Zion" societies. They elected Church members into local political positions and were feared to have an outsized influence in local and state politics. In slave states such as Missouri, they were mistrusted since most of the Latter-day Saints were northerners opposed to slavery.

³⁷ Wherever they settled, Latter-day Saint communities soon became quite prosperous, often turning unwanted and unused land into beautifully cultivated farms. As Church members were forced to flee, their land was either taken over by others or purchased for extremely low prices.

³⁸ Media representations of Church leaders often depicted them with horns, and they were inaccurately depicted as worshipping the devil.

³⁹ See infra notes 40-46 and accompanying text.

For example, in 1833, the local county leaders and citizens of Jackson County, Missouri, abandoned the rule of law to drive out the Saints from the state. When large numbers of Saints began to gather in that area, local citizens worried about maintaining political power; the Church allowed blacks to be members in what was a slave state, and Saints claimed God had led them to the area to settle.⁴⁰ County leaders summoned Latter-day Saint leaders to the courthouse and stated their intent to drive the Saints from the County by any means necessary.⁴¹ When Church authorities requested three months to respond, they were given fifteen minutes. The expulsion would begin immediately.⁴²

In November 1839, the Latter-day Saints appealed to the U.S. president once Missouri local and state authorities failed to grant protection from violence and theft.⁴³ Joseph Smith and fellow Church leader Elias Higbee traveled to Washington. After listening to their complaints, President Martin Van Buren famously replied, "Gentlemen, your cause is just, but I can do nothing for you."⁴⁴ He stated that his support might risk losing Missouri in the next election.⁴⁵ When the Senate later deliberated over Smith's petition, they also rejected it under the rationale that Congress did not have the power to force the State of Missouri to pay reparations to the Saints.⁴⁶

Later all three federal branches of the U.S. government upheld discriminatory policies aimed specifically against Latter-day Saint (LDS) members. After the Church was established in the Utah territory, the U.S. Congress passed a wave of laws designed to destroy the Church. For example, the Edmunds-Tucker Act, adopted in 1887, disenfranchised LDS women from voting (which territorial right had been established for almost twenty years); disinherited LDS children from their families' property; and forbade members of the Church from serving on juries, voting, and serving in government office.⁴⁷ The

46 See 4 SMITH, HISTORY, supra note 5, at 90–92; Ronald O. Barney, Joseph Smith Goes to Washington, in JOSEPH SMITH, THE PROPHET AND SEER 391, 413–18 (Richard Neitzel Holzapfel & Kent P. Jackson eds., 2010).

47 Edmunds-Tucker Act, ch. 397, 24 Stat. 635 (1887) (codified at 48 U.S.C. § 1457), *repealed by* Repeal of Law Establishing Limits on the Amount of Land Which Certain Religious Corporations May Hold in any Territory of the United States, Pub. L. No. 95-584, 92 Stat. 2483.

⁴⁰ SMITH, HISTORY, supra note 5, at 372–76.

⁴¹ See id. at 376.

⁴² Id. at 411.

^{43 4} id. at 24-38.

⁴⁴ Id. at 80 (emphasis omitted).

⁴⁵ See id. Constitutionally speaking, President Van Buren was correct in that the First Amendment gave no power to the executive to prohibit state restraints on the free exercise of religion. However, there were no constitutional limits on what the President could have achieved had he chosen to exercise political influence on Mormon behalf.

Church ceased to exist as a legal entity, and the government was given authority to seize Church assets.⁴⁸

The U.S. Supreme Court upheld the discriminatory statutes. In 1890, the Court upheld the Edmunds-Tucker Act in *Late Corporation of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints v. United States.*⁴⁹ Also in 1890, when the Idaho Territorial Legislature systematically barred Latter-day Saints from voting or holding public office—disenfranchising one-quarter of the territory's population—the Act was upheld by the Court.⁵⁰

In 1879, the State Department even attempted to extend discriminatory policies to international affairs. The U.S. Secretary of State requested that foreign governments no longer allow Mormons to emigrate to the United States to prevent the "large numbers of immigrants [who] come to our shores every year from the various countries of Europe for the avowed purpose of joining the Mormon community at Salt Lake."⁵¹ Foreign countries did not comply.⁵²

1. Inclusion

Despite the historical failings of the State, time and mellowing demonstrated that governments also have the power to be a vehicle for eroding prejudice. National temperature toward the Saints settled by degrees as continued exposure to the Saints improved public perception. Patriotic participation of large numbers of Latter-day Saints in both World Wars⁵³ and greater exposure to Utah and areas

⁴⁸ See John R. Vile, Late Corporation of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints v. United States (1890), THE FIRST AMEND. ENCYC., https://www.mtsu.edu/first-amendment/article/171/late-corporation-of-the-church-of-jesus-christ-of-latter-day-saints-v-united-states [https://perma.cc/LC9N-ULEU].

⁴⁹ Late Corp. of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints v. United States, 136 U.S. 1, 46, 64 (1890).

⁵⁰ Merle W. Wells, *The Idaho Anti-Mormon Test Oath*, 1884–1892, 24 PAC. HIST. REV. 235, 235, 246 (1955).

⁵¹ William Evarts, Circular No. 10, Sent to the Diplomatic Officers of the United States, in 1 U.S. DEP'T OF STATE, INDEX TO THE EXECUTIVE DOCUMENTS OF THE HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES FOR THE SECOND SESSION OF THE FORTY-SIXTH CONGRESS, 1879-'80, at 11, 11 (1880); see also William Mulder, Immigration and the "Mormon Question": An International Episode, 9 W. POL. Q. 416, 422–28 (1956).

⁵² *See* Mulder, *supra* note 51, at 422–28.

⁵³ See Trent Toone, Events Surrounding World Wars Had Significant Impact on LDS Church and General Conference, DESERET NEWS (Apr. 3, 2017), https://www.deseret.com/2017/4/3/20609680/events-surrounding-world-wars-had-

significant-impact-on-lds-church-and-general-conference [https://perma.cc/XN9E-PLGJ] ("Several future apostles and one church president served in World War II, including Elder David B. Haight, Elder Neal A. Maxwell and Elder L. Tom Perry and President Boyd K. Packer and President Thomas S. Monson."). On April 6, 1942, President J. Reuben Clark, first counselor in the First Presidency, said that when church members are called "into the armed service of any country to which they owe allegiance, their highest civic duty requires

populated with large numbers of Saints to visitors from every walk of life eventually led to more high-profile Latter-day Saint political participation in the twentieth century and onwards.

Looking at the Latter-day Saint journey from persecution to inclusion can be examined today using scholars' modern measure of religious persecution in the twofold light of both government restrictions on a particular faith and on social hostilities against members of that faith.⁵⁴ In that sense, the story of serious persecution (as opposed to mere prejudice) against Latter-day Saints in the United States has two endings. The era of mob violence ended when the Church found itself safely ensconced in the Salt Lake Valley after 1847.⁵⁵ Government anti-Mormon policy began to lose steam with the Church manifesto discontinuing polygamy in 1890 and the admission of the Utah territory as the forty-fifth state in 1896.⁵⁶ A more conclusive ending came when Reed Smoot, a Latter-day Saint apostle and nonpolygamist, was elected to the United States Senate in 1903 and, after a protracted confirmation battle, was allowed to take his seat in 1907, where he served until 1933.⁵⁷

A more recent development in the state of Utah demonstrates the opportunity governments possess to give legal protections to minority groups. The "Utah Compromise" contains two laws passed by the Utah State Legislature in 2015 that seek to balance the demands of religious liberty with the demands of nondiscrimination against the LGBTQ community.⁵⁸ Though not without critics, a consensus has developed that views the Compromise as a fair and good-faith effort to mutually vindicate important interests that can sometimes be strained.⁵⁹

B. Other Religious Communities / Majority Faiths

Majority faiths are frequently a source of opposition and distress to minority religions anywhere that two or more religions are gathered in a single community. Throughout U.S. history, numerous religious

that they meet that call." *Id.*; *see also* Dennis A. Wright, *Voices of War: The Experiences of LDS Servicemen During the D-Day Invasion, in* 4 REG'L STUD. IN LATTER-DAY SAINT CHURCH HIST.: EUROPE 109–28 (Donald Q. Cannon & Brent L. Top eds., 2003).

⁵⁴ See generally PEW RSCH. CTR, MORMONS IN AMERICA: CERTAIN IN THEIR BELIEFS, UNCERTAIN OF THEIR PLACE IN SOCIETY (2012).

⁵⁵See TheGreatMormonMigration,PBS,https://www.pbs.org/wgbh/americanexperience/features/mormon-migration/

[[]https://perma.cc/2B3F-VL79]; NO UNHALLOWED HAND, supra note 27, at 65.

⁵⁶ See KATHLEEN FLAKE, THE POLITICS OF AMERICAN RELIGIOUS IDENTITY: THE SEATING OF SENATOR REED SMOOT, MORMON APOSTLE 5 (2004).

⁵⁷ See id. at 12, 160, 169.

⁵⁸ See Stuart Adams, The Utah Compromise, L. & LIBERTY (Apr. 14, 2015), https://lawliberty.org/the-utah-compromise [https://perma.cc/TR6U-HLL3].

⁵⁹ See id.

minorities have experienced persecution at the hands of religious majorities, most notably Protestants, which historically have been the largest religious demographic in the United States. Jews, Catholics, Muslims, and Jehovah's Witnesses, to name a few, have each endured seasons of persecution. For Latter-day Saints, this has been a persistent reality. Recall that the first to abuse the young Joseph Smith for his claims to divine revelation was the clergy of other denominations.⁶⁰

Religious prejudice and religious persecution are not synonymous, but majority faiths have perpetuated both against Latterday Saints. Persecution involves serious actions and violence, while prejudice harms minority groups in more subtle ways. Latter-day Saints suffered persecution for much of their early history; members of other faiths destroyed Latter-day Saints' property and violently expelled them from their homes. Prejudice against Latter-day Saints incited by larger religious communities has diminished over time in the later twentieth and early twenty-first centuries, though religious prejudice still lingers today.⁶¹

1. Inclusion

Majority faiths can be powerful voices to protect minorities. As an eloquent example, Richard Mouw, resident of the Fuller Theological Seminary and author of *Talking with Mormons: An Invitation to Evangelicals*, invites his evangelical readers to "nurture friendlier relations with the Mormon community."⁶²

Mouw says, "I want us to listen carefully to our Mormon neighbors, without deciding ahead of time what they 'really' believe. Patience, humility, a willingness to admit our own shortcomings—all of these are necessary to move the dialogue forward."⁶³

Mouw later adds, "The goal of all this is not simply to understand—although that's a worthy goal. It's to earn the trust that allows genuine dialogue about our deepest convictions."⁶⁴ Though Mouw disagrees with much of Latter-day Saint theology, he emphasizes that understanding and trust are prerequisites that are good ends in

⁶⁰ Joseph Smith—History, supra note 8 at 1:21–26.

⁶¹ Mitt Romney's run for the presidency provided numerous examples of how that religious-based prejudice lingers even today. A 2012 poll showed that 18% of Americans would not vote for an otherwise well-qualified Mormon presidential candidate. Frank Newport, *Bias Against a Mormon Presidential Candidate Same as in 1967*, GALLUP (June 21, 2012), https://news.gallup.com/poll/155273/bias-against-mormon-presidential candidate-1967.aspx [https://perma.cc/8THS-YJTR].

⁶² RICHARD J. MOUW, TALKING WITH MORMONS: AN INVITATION TO EVANGELICALS 43 (2012).

⁶³ Id. at 43.

⁶⁴ Id. at 94.

themselves.⁶⁵ He is an example of one of America's largest religious traditions extending a hand of friendship to Latter-day Saints.

In addition to majority religions, prominent institutions with strong religious ties can be strong advocates for minorities. Recently, there have been Latter-day Saint joint initiatives with America's National Association for the Advancement of Colored People (NAACP), which includes membership of many traditional African-American Protestants. As recently as June 2021, the Church and the NAACP announced an agreement to join in providing educational opportunities and humanitarian benefits to be shared by America's black communities.⁶⁶

According to one report: the Church and the NAACP—an international Church and a national organization joined by their belief "in the fatherhood of God and the brotherhood of man" and in Jesus Christ—are motivated to action, President Nelson said.⁶⁷ "We call for greater civility and kindness. And we work together to bless the lives of God's children."⁶⁸

Majority faiths and prominent religious institutions can exercise their influence to promote religious acceptance among their constituents. For example, in March 2019 President Russell M. Nelson became the first President of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints to meet face to face with a Pope.⁶⁹ He and Pope Francis

67 Id.

⁶⁵ See id.

⁶⁶ Sarah Jane Weaver, *First Presidency*, *NAACP Announce Major Education and Humanitarian Initiatives*, CHURCH NEWS (June 14, 2021), https://www.thechurchnews.com/leaders-and-ministry/2021-06-14/first-presidency-naacp-announce-education-humanitarian-initiatives-

 $[\]label{eq:216156} 216156 \#:\sim:text=First\%20 Presidency\%2C\%20 NAACP\%20 announce\%20 major\%20 education\%20 and\%20 humanitarian\%20 initiatives,-$

View%2017%20more&text=Standing%20side%20by%20side%20in,initiatives%20on%20M onday%2C%20June%2014 [https://perma.cc/4DJX-FVKQ].

⁶⁸ Id. The initiatives will include humanitarian efforts: the Church has pledged \$2 million per year for the next three years "to encourage service and help to those in need" and promote self-reliance. Id. Scholarships for black students: Latter-day Saints have committed to fund a \$1 million scholarship donation per year for three years, overseen by the United Negro College Fund. Id. A fellowship to send up to fifty students to Ghana to learn about history: the Church will donate \$250,000 to create the Amos C. Brown Student Fellowship to Ghana—allowing selected students from the United States an opportunity to learn more about their heritage. See also First Presidency and NAACP Leaders Call for Greater Civility, Racial Harmony, THE CHURCH OF JESUS CHRIST OF LATTER-DAY SAINTS (May 17, 2018), https://newsroom.churchofjesuschrist.org/article/joint-statement-first-presidencynaacp-national-leadership [https://perma.cc/5N92-KXU4]; Locking Arms for Racial Harmony in America, MEDIUM (June 8, 2020), https://medium.com/@Ch_JesusChrist /locking-arms-for-racial-harmony-in-america-2f62180abf37 [https://perma.cc/BJE6-YYFD].

⁶⁹ Peggy Fletcher Stack & David Noyce, Pope Francis, Russell Nelson Share a Hug, Discuss Global Relief in First-ever Meeting Between a Latter-day Saint Prophet and a Catholic Pontiff, THE

discussed, among other things, global efforts to relieve human suffering.⁷⁰ As noted in Utah's *Salt Lake Tribune* newspaper: "While the historic encounter may not be as significant for the world's 1.2 billion Catholics—popes frequently give audiences to foremost religious figures—the spiritual calculus adds up to watershed recognition for the globe's 16 million Latter-day Saints."⁷¹ Such meetings take relatively little effort for majority faiths but show significant respect for diverse minority faiths.

C. The Media—The Popular Press / Political Cartoons / Fiction and Literature

By their nature, the press and mass media can be the tools of prejudice and persecution or the tools of positive integration and acceptance. In modern society with the internet, a written comment or even film clip can be composed and sent to the other side of the globe in a matter of minutes. The ubiquity of such messages usually lessens the impact of any single propaganda piece, but their ease of composition and transmission allows false, misleading, or harmful messages to reach large audiences quickly.

The press spread misinformation and prejudice against the Latterday Saints in their early history. When the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints was founded in the nineteenth century, mass media organs consisted largely of books, newspapers, public addresses, and the occasional song or theatrical piece. Latter-day Saints were targeted in all of these. The early twentieth century saw a magazine campaign against the Church. Political cartoons, satirizing the Church and its practices, were commonly focused on such topics as LDS immigration and plural marriage, and included depictions of Mormonism as a hostile reptile (like the Roman Catholic church), Mormons having horns, Mormons and the priesthood patriarchy, the Senate committee hearing on Senator Smoot, the *Reynolds v. United States* Supreme Court case, and alleged secret Church works in Salt Lake City (which were compared to the Ku Klux Klan).⁷²

SALT LAKE TRIB. (Mar. 9, 2019), https://www.sltrib.com/religion/2019/03/09/pope-francis-latter-day (last visited May 10, 2022). *See also* Michelle Boorstein, *After Decades of Behind-the-scenes Diplomacy, Leaders of Catholic, Mormon Churches Meet in Rome*, WASH. POST, (Mar. 9, 2019,), https://www.washingtonpost.com/religion/2019/03/09/after-decades-behind-the-scenes-diplomacy-leaders-catholic-mormon-churches-meet-rome [https://perma.cc/C43Z-3ZS7].

⁷⁰ Stack & Noyce, *supra* note 69.

⁷¹ Id.

⁷² See GARY L. BUNKER, THE MORMON GRAPHIC IMAGE, 1834–1914: CARTOONS, CARICATURES, AND ILLUSTRATIONS (1983); Gary L. Bunker & Davis Bitton, *Illustrated Periodical Images of Mormons*, 10 DIALOGUE: J. MORMON THOUGHT 82, 82–92 (1977); Michael H. Paulos, *Political Cartooning and the Reed Smoot Hearings*, SUNSTONE, Dec. 2006, at

Literature, both fiction and nonfiction, was also a vehicle for spreading misinformation and prejudice. Works defaming Latter-day Saint beliefs and practices were many and notorious. The first "anti-Mormon" book was likely 1834's *Mormonism Unvailed* by E.D. Howe, which purported to be "a faithful account of that singular imposition and delusion, from its rise to the present time."⁷³ This was the first of many.⁷⁴

1. Inclusion

The popular press, which did so much to damage the Church's reputation in its early years, also gets some credit for its social habilitation in the later-twentieth and early-twenty-first centuries. Representative examples include interviews with then Church president Gordon B. Hinckley on the American television newsweekly 60 Minutes and on Larry King Live and generally positive coverage of the Church in publications ranging from Time Magazine, U.S. News and World Report, and The New York Times.⁷⁵

D. The Persecuted Group Themselves

Any assessment of how a persecuted people may have contributed to their own persecution risks accentuating the tendencies of some to

^{36, 36–40; ;} Michael W. Homer, *The Mormon Image in Comics*, SUNSTONE, Sept. 2010, at 68, 68–73; MICHAEL H. PAULOS, KENNETH L. CANNON & THOMAS G. ALEXANDER, CARTOONISTS AND MUCKRAKERS: SELECTED MEDIA IMAGES OF MORMONISM DURING THE PROGRESSIVE ERA (2011).

⁷³ E.D. HOWE, MORMONISM UNVAILED (1834).

⁷⁴ See, e.g., JOHN D. LEE, MORMONISM UNVEILED; INCLUDING THE REMARKABLE LIFE AND CONFESSIONS OF THE LATE MORMON BISHOP, JOHN D. LEE; AND COMPLETE LIFE OF BRIGHAM YOUNG EMBRACING A HISTORY OF MORMONISM FROM ITS INCEPTION DOWN TO THE PRESENT TIME, WITH AN EXPOSITION OF THE SECRET HISTORY, SIGN, SYMBOLS, AND CRIMES OF THE MORMON CHURCH: ALSO THE TRUE HISTORY OF THE HORRIBLE BUTCHERY KNOWN AS THE MOUNTAIN MEADOWS MASSACRE (2001).

⁶⁰ Minutes (CBS television broadcast Apr. 7, 1996); Pres. Gordon B. Hinckley on Larry 75 (Full Interview), YOUTUBE 2014), King Live (June 5, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jAsNMWwRXvs [https://perma.cc/5J6A-5WBK]; A Conversation with Gordon B. Hinckley, President of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints, https://transcripts.cnn.com/show/lkl/date/2004-12-26/segment/01 CNN, [https://perma.cc/Z7BX-442Z] (aired December 26, 2004); Mormons: Prosperity & Protest, TIME (Apr. 1967), 14, http:// content.time.com/time/magazine/article/0,9171,836990,00.html [https://perma.cc/JS3E-VCZ8]; James Fallows, The World Beyond Salt Lake City, U.S. NEWS (May & WORLD 2, Rep. 1988), https://plus.lexis.com/document?pddocfullpath=%2Fshared%2Fdocument%2Fnews%2F urn%3AcontentItem%3A3SJ4-G8R0-000C-D1C2-00000-

^{00&}amp;pdsourcegroupingtype=&pdcontentcomponentid=8065&pdisurlapi=true&pdmfid=15 30671&crid=58263dea-173d-4dc0-b6af-3d9879264668 [https://perma.cc/F72K-WXLH].

rationalize human rights abuses. It is all too easy to declare that if they would just have ceased to make certain claims, renounced beliefs, or discontinued practices offensive to the persecutors, the problems of the persecuted would have been solved. Offenders are susceptible to a "blame the victim" mentality in most abusive situations. Nevertheless, by their responses, victims of persecution can affect and perhaps exacerbate their circumstances. Latter-day Saints are no exception.

For example, when large numbers of Saints began arriving at the western frontier of Jackson County, Missouri, they began to dominate the county with their political voting power.⁷⁶ Many Saints were Northern and held anti-slavery opinions which conflicted with Missouri's status as a slave state.⁷⁷ The locals of Jackson County feared, ironically, becoming a political minority and felt that the Saints threatened their way of life by flooding the area with new settlor-Saints.⁷⁸ This led to persecution which ultimately culminated in Governor Bogg's Extermination Order that drove all Saints out of Missouri, leaving their property behind to the area's longer-established inhabitants.⁷⁹ By no means are the Jackson County locals' actions justified, but there is a recognizable trajectory between the Saints' arrival and the Missourians' response.

Persecuted groups tend to form stronger bonds with members of their group and withdraw from society, which may worsen mistrust on both sides. For instance, in the early history of the Church, the Saints responded to criticism and attack by becoming somewhat insular in their group. In the years after settling in Utah, much of this could likely be explained by the Church's intentional isolation to escape persecution and in its mistrust of the religious and political establishments where most criticisms originated. One of the recurring criticisms of the Church up to the mid-twentieth century was that Latter-day Saints were successfully attentive to the needs of their members but not so much to the needs of nonmembers.⁸⁰ For example, when the new railroad was being built through Utah, the Church leaders feared the consequences that an influx of trade would have on their fledgling economy, so they encouraged Saints to form cooperative stores and to only trade with each other.⁸¹ In his sermons,

⁷⁶ See Richard Lyman Bushman, Joseph Smith: Rough Stone Rolling 327–28 (2005).

⁷⁷ See id.

^{78 1} SMITH, HISTORY, *supra* note 5, at 374.

⁷⁹ Lilburn W. Boggs, Executive Order to John B. Clark (Oct. 27, 1838) (available at sos.mo.gov/archives/resources/findingaids/miscMormonRecords/eo [https://perma.cc/2U3Z-37G7]).

⁸⁰ See NO UNHALLOWED HAND, supra note 27, at 339–42.

⁸¹ See id. at 339–40.

Church leader Brigham Young frequently encouraged Church members to grow their food, make their clothes, and manufacture as much as they could for themselves and was openly critical of merchants who came to the territory to sell eastern goods at a profit.⁸² Within the School of the Prophets, leading Saints in the area were instructed only to do business with other members of the Church to keep money in circles where it could benefit the Saints instead of outside merchants.⁸³

In some cases, persecuted Saints responded with violence out of fear of retribution for past attacks. Most impartial scholars accept that Latter-day Saints retaliated minimally when persecuted. One exception occurred with the notorious "Mountain Meadows Massacre" in which a group of Latter-day Saint settlers residing in Southern Utah, along with a group of native American warriors whom they had incited, attacked a wagon train of Missourians who were passing through the Utah Territory. Rumors had spread of war with the U.S. government, of these travelers having participated in violent mobs that had evicted the Saints from Missouri, and of the Missourian travelers' talk of harming Utah settlers. The settlers and Indians attacked the wagons, killed all the adults, and carried off the children captive. The Latter-day Saint ringleader, John D. Lee, was tried and executed for leading the attack.⁸⁴ The violent attack fueled negative perceptions.

1. Inclusion

If one asks how much Latter-day Saints brought on their own troubles, one must likewise ask to what extent they contributed to their resolutions. In September 2016 at Windsor Castle, Elder Jeffrey R. Holland of the Quorum of the Twelve Apostles of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints spoke of the early Church members' experience of being hounded and persecuted from their homes in multiple locations until arriving in the desert land of Utah, where they erected a settlement where they could safely establish themselves.⁸⁵ Elder Holland used the term "pioneer," rather than "refugee" or "victim" to describe the oppressed Latter-day Saint migrants.⁸⁶ The

⁸² See id. at 339.

⁸³ See id.

⁸⁴ See Ronald W. Walker, Richard E. Turley, Jr. & Glen M. Leonard, Massacre at Mountain Meadows (2008); Sally Denton, American Massacre: The Tragedy at Mountain Meadows, September 1857 (2003); Will Bagley, Blood of the Prophets: Brigham Young and the Massacre at Mountain Meadows (2002); Juanita Brooks, The Mountain Meadows Massacre (1962).

⁸⁵ R. Scott Lloyd, Faith is Key to Rising from Refugee Status, Elder Holland Says, THE CHURCH OF JESUS CHRIST OF LATTER-DAY SAINTS (Sept. 13, 2017), https://www.churchofjesuschrist.org/church/news/faith-is-key-to-rising-from-refugee-status-elder-holland-says?lang=eng [https://perma.cc/S594-KV5H].

⁸⁶ See id.

term "pioneer" struck Baroness Emma Nicholson, sponsor of the conferences and AMAR head, and other attendees, who noted that the Saints' view of themselves as actors with some control over their destinies rather than as passive victims empowered the fleeing Latter-day Saints.⁸⁷

The Church's calm response to offensive remarks also reflects the Latter-day Saints' self-determinative perspective. The popular but profane *Book of Mormon* Broadway musical mocks its Latter-day Saint missionary protagonists and their religious beliefs.⁸⁸ Instead of launching protests and lawsuits, the Church responded by taking out ads in the show's program bill with such lines as, "[y]ou've seen the play, now read the book" or "[t]he book is always better."⁸⁹ The Church's response to the mockery was measured enough that, in some quarters—including the musical's creators—respect grew.⁹⁰

The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints takes inspiration from its persecuted past to aid other groups facing similar problems today. In the roughly twenty-five years since LDS Charities was organized, the Church has gone from providing relief for the less fortunate among its members to administering aid from hunger, poverty, and health challenges on a global scale through organized efforts made in conjunction with such entities as the Red Cross, Catholic Relief Services, and the United Nations.⁹¹ Influential organizations worldwide are paying attention to the Church's global humanitarian efforts. In 2014, the Church's humanitarian efforts were the focus of a United Nations meeting titled "Discovering Mormonism

⁸⁷ *See id.* "Individual conviction leading to purposeful action, no matter how great the odds against us, is not only our story but the story of many individuals and many institutions that have made a difference in the world," said Elder Holland. *Id.*

⁸⁸ See The Book of Mormon, BROADWAY.COM, https://www.broadway.com/shows/book-mormon/ [https://perma.cc/92VX-9STC].

Morgan Jones, How the LDS Church's Response to 'The Book of Mormon' Musical is 89 Working, DESERET NEWS (Nov. Actually 16. 2016). https://www.deseret.com/2016/11/16/20600593/how-the-lds-church-s-response-to-thebook-of-mormon-musical-is-actually-working [https://perma.cc/GAW7-ZUNC]. Chris Thomas, an award-winning public relations professional said, "The playbill ad is another example of the LDS Church's savvy response to 'The Book of Mormon' musical,' Instead of protesting the musical, which is something that many would do, especially religious organizations, they made a bold and deliberate decision to embrace the situation. They have taken something that could have been detrimental to the church's missionary efforts and made it positive." Id.

⁹⁰ See Terry Gross, 'Fresh Air' Favorites: 'Book of Mormon' Creators Trey Parker and Matt Stone, NPR (Dec. 27, 2019), https://www.npr.org/2019/12/27/790794191/fresh-airfavorites-book-of-mormon-creators-trey-parker-and-matt-stone [https://perma.cc/EF7U-9V6E].

⁹¹ See LDS CHARITIES, 2016 LDS CHARITIES ANNUAL REPORT (2017).

and Its Role in Humanitarian Assistance."⁹² Wherever possible the Church partners with other established relief organizations and local providers.⁹³

One great impetus to Latter-day Saint recovery is the Church's efforts to reach out and mix with the larger society, whether as missionaries, students, politicians, or entrepreneurs. The Christian mandate shared with many other faiths to "[g]o ye into all the world"⁹⁴ with the message of the gospel is reflected in Latter-day Saint outreach efforts with the wider world.

E. Business and Commerce

Business interests have also been a source of discrimination and persecution. These take several forms, such as formal or informal boycotts of the businesses of members of particular faiths and discriminatory practices in hiring. Latter-day Saints have found themselves on both the giving and the receiving end of business bias, and at the same time, Latter-day Saints have used business and commerce to pave the way toward positive recognition.

Prejudice often finds an outlet through business persecution and hiring practices. As an example, the Church suffered significant business persecution early in its history at the hands of a man named Grandison Newell. Newell refused to hire Latter-day Saints that came to him for work, and, more significantly, he sought to ruin a local bank that the Church set up in Kirtland, Ohio, the Kirtland Safety Society.95 Newell hoarded many of the bank's coin-backed notes and then demanded payment for them all at once, hoping to deplete the bank's reserves enough that it would collapse.⁹⁶ This persecution, combined with a national economic downturn in the United States and other problems, ultimately led to the bank's failure⁹⁷ and associated significant financial loss to Latter-day Saints, especially Joseph Smith.98 The early Church also suffered other instances of business persecution. Early pioneers faced discrimination from businesses in the South and when trying to make their way West from the East and from Europe. For example, some businesses sought to cheat Church

⁹² Mormon Representatives Discuss Church Humanitarian Efforts at the United Nations, THE CHURCH OF JESUS CHRIST OF LATTER-DAY SAINTS (Feb. 2014), https://philanthropies.churchofjesuschrist.org/humanitarian-services/news-features/mormon-representatives-united-nations-discussion [https://perma.cc/G624-Q3VD].

⁹³ *See About Us*, LATTER-DAY SAINT CHARITIES, https://www.latterdaysaintcharities.org /about-us [https://perma.cc/8EC2-T954].

⁹⁴ Mark 16:15 (King James).

⁹⁵ See THE STANDARD OF TRUTH, supra note 9, at 296-98

⁹⁶ See id. at 260-61, 264-65.

⁹⁷ See id. at 266-68, 272.

⁹⁸ See id. at 266, 272, 298.

members when buying heirlooms from them or refusing their patronage.⁹⁹

The perception that the Church is discriminatory in its business practices, both past and present, can also fuel prejudice. For example, after the Saints settled in Utah, Brigham Young encouraged the building of an economic cooperative or "co-op store" in every town to provide Saints with their basic needs at a fair price instead of engaging in trade with outsiders.¹⁰⁰ During the early days of Brigham Young Academy, in Provo, Brigham Young urged members of the school to do business primarily with each other to keep their resources with the Saints.¹⁰¹ These exclusionary practices did not help Saints integrate with the larger society. Today, the Church itself has many business holdings which generate considerable revenues, and it draws criticism from time to time from those who question how the Church chooses to distribute earnings from those holdings. The internet is rife with stories supposing to unearth dark secrets of the Church and its wealth. Some critics, often without full understanding, suggest that the Church is skirting tax obligations or using its resources for non-compelling causes.102

1. Inclusion

Though business practices and financial "squeezing" have inflicted prejudice on the Church in the past, business enterprises have also helped Latter-day Saints break into mainstream American society. Well-known twentieth and twenty-first century business figures have included prominent Latter-day Saints who have managed to earn respect along with considerable wealth in the country's halls of commerce. According to a 2012 article in *The Economist*, "Less than 2% of Americans are Mormons, yet their commercial prominence belies their numbers.... Mormons have [also] constructed a huge

⁹⁹ See, e.g., PATRICK Q. MASON, THE MORMON MENACE: VIOLENCE AND ANTI-MORMONISM IN THE POSTBELLUM SOUTH (2011) (exploring how Southerners encountered and then countered the perceived Mormon menace in their midst and examining the impact of southern anti-Mormonism on Mormons' identity in the West); Gene A. Sessions, *Myth, Mormonism, and Murder in the South*, 75 S. ATL. Q. 212 (1976).

¹⁰⁰ See NO UNHALLOWED HAND, supra note 27, at 347.

¹⁰¹ Id. at 345.

¹⁰² See, e.g., Jon Swaine, Douglas MacMillan & Michelle Boorstein, Mormon Church Has Misled Members on \$100 Billion Tax-Exempt Investment Fund, Whistleblower Alleges, WASH. POST (Dec. 17, 2019), https://www.washingtonpost.com/investigations/mormon-church-hasmisled-members-on-100-billion-tax-exempt-investment-fund-whistlebloweralleges/2019/12/16/e3619bd2-2004-11ea-86f3-3b5019d451db_story.html [https://perma.cc/67WR-P9G7].

pro-business infrastructure."¹⁰³ Another article remarks, "The state is as welcoming to immigrants as it is to investors—and one of the fastest-growing in both population and output."¹⁰⁴

Within certain hiring circles, Latter-day Saints have gained a distinct, desirable reputation. At Brigham Young University (BYU), a private university supported by the Church, employer-recruiters are drawn to the broad array of languages that the majority of Latter-day Saint students learned on their proselyting and humanitarian missions. The CIA regularly holds recruiting sessions on BYU's campus to recruit speakers of less common languages, for example, and FBI background checks on applicants often pass quickly because of the Latter-day Saint mandate to not participate in drugs and alcohol.¹⁰⁵ Latter-day Saint entrepreneurs have a hard-working reputation which regularly draws investors to Utah.¹⁰⁶

F. Neighbors

One of the most disheartening features of religious persecution is that while we can think of this as a distant problem controlled by distant forces, a large part of persecution occurs near at hand, with neighbors persecuting neighbors. Those who live near individuals or groups of a disdained religion are frequently the worst perpetrators of violence and abuse. In some cases, neighbors' persecution stems from their feeling that they have much to lose from the local establishment of the distrusted group, but in other cases, disgust for Latter-day Saint beliefs led neighbors to tar and feather, evict, and give death threats to Saints.

Examples of persecution by neighbors are numerous and prominent in the Church's early history. This persecution ranged from mockery and defamation to violence and pillaging. Neighbors of the Church persecuted Joseph Smith, among other Church leaders, and the Church as a whole.

¹⁰³ The Mormon Way of Business, THE ECONOMIST (May 5, 2012), https://www.economist.com/business/2012/05/05/the-mormon-way-of-business [https://perma.cc/BA4M-E225].

¹⁰⁴ Why Utah's Conservatism Is Better, THE ECONOMIST (Apr. 29, 2021), https://www.economist.com/united-states/2021/04/29/why-utahs-conservatism-is-better [https://perma.cc/557D-WKKT].

¹⁰⁵ See Sarah Laskow, Why Mormons Make Great FBI Recruits, ATLAS OBSCURA (Nov. 4, 2015), https://www.atlasobscura.com/articles/why-mormons-make-great-fbi-recruits [https://perma.cc/3B3F-4E58].

¹⁰⁶ See Adam Bluestein, *How Mormons Built the Next Silicon Valley While No One Was Looking*, MEDIUM (Jan. 15, 2020), https://marker.medium.com/how-mormons-built-the-next-silicon-valley-while-no-one-was-looking-c50add577478 [h ttps://perma.cc/D9C7-Q2AP].

Neighborly persecution followed Joseph Smith from the time he shared his first vision and ultimately led to his death. Joseph reported that in years following this vision, he constantly "suffer[ed] severe persecution at the hands of all classes of men, both religious and irreligious, because [he] continued to affirm that [he] had seen a vision."¹⁰⁷

At different times in his life, neighbors defamed him in newspapers,¹⁰⁸ threatened him with physical harm,¹⁰⁹ and carried out physical attacks against him for his teachings and leadership of the Church.¹¹⁰ Eventually, Joseph and his brother were murdered by a local mob in Carthage, Illinois in 1844.¹¹¹

Neighborly persecution persistently plagued not only Joseph Smith, but also the early Church generally. Neighbors threatened Church members¹¹² and disrupted their meetings in New York.¹¹³ Mobs of citizens looted and burned Latter-day Saints' homes and property; destroyed Latter-day Saint businesses; and beat, abused, and murdered Latter-day Saints in Missouri.¹¹⁴ Hostile neighbors drove the Saints out of New York, Ohio, Missouri, and Illinois.¹¹⁵

After this last forcible expulsion from their gathering place, the Saints trekked west to the Great Basin, a distant, sparsely inhabited area that promised safety from persecution by neighbors. Even after this exodus, however, the Latter-day Saints did not entirely escape such persecution. Saints in the United States continued to endure persecution by hostile neighbors. In 1857, newspapers in the East once again began to publish reports that President Buchanan was planning to send a new governor to Utah at the head of an army to replace Brigham Young and free the Latter-day Saint women from (supposed) oppression.¹¹⁶ If Brigham Young were to protest, he would be hanged

107 Joseph Smith—History, supra note 8 at 1:27.

108 See THE STANDARD OF TRUTH, supra note 9, at 534.

- 111 Id. at 547, 551–52.
- 112 See, e.g., id. at 95.
- 113 See id. at 94-95.
- 114 See id. at 171, 177, 180, 188, 348-50.

115SeeAnti-MormonViolence,PBS,https://www.pbs.org/wgbh/americanexperience/features/mormons-opposition/

[https://perma.cc/Z8J2-BSMH].

116 See The Utah War, THE CHURCH OF JESUS CHRIST OF LATTER-DAY SAINTS, https://abn.churchofjesuschrist.org/study/manual/church-history-in-the-fulness-of-times/chapter-twenty-

 $nine?lang=eng\&adobe_mc_ref=https\%3A\%2F\%2Fwww.churchofjesuschrist.org\%2Fstudy\%2Fmanual\%2Fchurch-history-in-the-fulness-of-times\%2Fchapter-twenty-$

nine%3Flang%3Deng&adobe_mc_sdid=SDID%3D0476393171D4240F-

46957538D34856AE%7CMCORGID%3D66C5485451E56AAE0A490D45%2540AdobeOrg %7CTS%3D1652307557 [https://perma.cc/QZ3K-DGNT].

¹⁰⁹ See id. at 95.

¹¹⁰ See, e.g., id. at 151–53.

up by the neck.¹¹⁷ Latter-day Saint spies traveling with the United States Army to Utah sent reports back to Brigham Young detailing what the soldiers boasted they intended to do to the Mormons when they got to Utah. Fearing the oncoming atrocities, Brigham Young declared martial law and prepared the Territory to resist if necessary.¹¹⁸ As public opinion towards the Saints continued to sour in the Eastern United States, persecution of the Saints began to increase sharply. People were once more being mobbed, threatened, and tarred and feathered by members of their communities.¹¹⁹ Parley Pratt, one of the Church's top leaders, was brutally murdered by a man in Arkansas in 1857.¹²⁰

Although persecution of Latter-day Saints has essentially concluded in the United States, neighborly prejudice is far from a thing of the past. Such prejudice can be seen in efforts by some people to publicly malign the Church and its teachings on the internet¹²¹ and in other settings. In addition, Latter-day Saints may be ostracized by their neighbors,¹²² particularly in areas where Latter-day Saints are a minority.

1. Inclusion

While Latter-day Saints have historically endured extensive persecution by neighbors, they have also benefited from benevolent inclusion by neighbors. Early in the Church's history, after the Saints were driven out of Missouri, non-Latter-day Saints in Quincy, Illinois welcomed and helped feed, clothe, shelter, and employ refugee Saints during a dire winter.¹²³ When the Latter-day Saints were settling in current-day Utah after being driven out of Illinois, Native Americans

¹¹⁷ See 2 SMITH, HISTORY, supra note 5, at 249.

¹¹⁸ See Lee Davidson, America's Forgotten War: LDS Raiders Kept Army at Bay in 1857–58, DESERET NEWS (Jul. 9, 2006), https://www.deseret.com/2006/7/9/19962913/america-sforgotten-war-lds-raiders-kept-army-at-bay-in-1857–58 [https://perma.cc/B6VS-BLPN]; The Utah War, supra note 116.

¹¹⁹ See 3 SMITH, HISTORY, supra note 40, at 218; 6 id. at XLI.

¹²⁰ See MASON, supra note 99, at 4.

¹²¹ This occurs, for example, on websites that oppose the Church. *See What Mormons Don't Tell*, CHRISTIAN RSCH. & COUNS., https://www.crcmin.org/what-mormons-don-t-tell [https://perma.cc/6MDA-74R4].

¹²² See Elder Gerrit W. Gong, All Nations, Kindreds, and Tongues, THE CHURCH OF JESUS CHRIST OF LATTER-DAY SAINTS, https://www.churchofjesuschrist.org/study/generalconference/2020/10/24gong?lang=eng [https://perma.cc/R2V5-6GDD] (sharing the story of a Latter-day Saint family that was initially not welcomed in a new neighborhood because of their religion but became more accepted and got help from neighbors when the family's house burned down).

¹²³ See THE STANDARD OF TRUTH, supra note 9, at 377.

in the area, for the most part, welcomed them and sought friendly relations with them.¹²⁴

The contemporary Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints still both receives and makes significant efforts at neighborly inclusion. Church initiatives such as the Church's partnership with the NAACP to provide scholarships to promote racial harmony in America and to provide scholarships for African Americans help promote the inclusion of others and strengthen the Church's connections with society.¹²⁵

A major tenet in the Latter-day Saint faith is service toward neighbors. Church leaders regularly encourage participation in local charity and humanitarian aid organizations.¹²⁶ LDS Charities explains its mission on its site; when a disaster strikes, Latter-day Saints work with local Church leaders, government officials, and trusted partners

indians%3Flang%3Deng&adobe_mc_sdid=SDID%3D2841C6890F19D5F5-

0607C97BABB3A1A9%7CMCORGID%3D66C5485451E56AAE0A490D45%2540AdobeOrg %7CTS%3D1652313122 [https://perma.cc/C4LC-RKHQ].

125 See Weaver, supra note 66.

Latter-day Saint Charities has provided more than *two billion* dollars in aid to assist those in need throughout the world. This assistance is offered to recipients regardless of their church affiliation, nationality, race, sexual orientation, gender, or political persuasion...

To date, the Church's humanitarian initiative has helped provide clean water in hundreds of communities in 76 countries....

In the year 2018 alone, the Church provided emergency supplies to refugees in 56 countries. In addition, many Church members volunteer their time to help refugees integrate into new communities....

Through generous donations to Deseret Industries outlets in the United States, millions of pounds of clothing are collected and sorted each year...

And just last year [2018], the Church provided vision care for more than 300,000 people in 35 countries, newborn care for thousands of mothers and infants in 39 countries, and wheelchairs for more than 50,000 people living in dozens of countries....

Last year alone, the Church carried out more than 100 disaster-relief projects around the world, helping victims of hurricanes, fires, floods, earthquakes, and other calamities. Whenever possible, our Church members in yellow Helping Hands vests mobilize in great numbers to help those afflicted by the disaster. This kind of service, rendered by so many of you, is the very essence of ministering.

Russell M. Nelson, President, Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Address at the General Conference of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints: The Second Great Commandment (Oct. 2019).

¹²⁴ See American Indians, THE CHURCH OF JESUS CHRIST OF LATTER-DAY SAINTS, https://abn.churchofjesuschrist.org/study/history/topics/american-

indians?lang=eng&adobe_mc_ref=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.churchofjesuschrist.org%2Fstud y%2Fhistory%2Ftopics%2Famerican-

¹²⁶ The following excerpts from a sermon by Russell M. Nelson, president of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, explore the scope of Church humanitarian efforts:

[VOL. 97:3

to determine what supplies and food are needed.¹²⁷ Materials are then purchased or assembled locally or shipped from Latter-day Saint storehouses. After urgent needs are met, the Church looks for additional ways to aid in long-term efforts.¹²⁸

Broader, international humanitarian efforts aim to treat geographically distant people as neighbors. LDS Charities, the humanitarian arm of the Church, was created in 1985 in response to the Ethiopian famine. The Church called for a special fast and monetary donation among its membership.¹²⁹ Since then, the Church has responded to many other needs around the world.¹³⁰

G. Academia

Academia has spread both notoriety and appreciation of the Latter-day Saint tradition, both through positive and defamatory academic writings and the reputation spread by prominent Latter-day Saint scholars.

Early "academic" writings about the Church were almost exclusively anti-Mormon. Academic studies routinely referred to the Latter-day Saints and "Mormonism" as a "problem" or "menace."¹³¹ These writings mixed a confusing blend of truth and harmful fiction with little regard for authenticity.

1. Inclusion

While early academicians contributed much to anti-Latter-day Saint prejudice, others, in and out of the Church, ultimately contributed to its legitimization in the twentieth and twenty-first centuries.

¹²⁷ See About Us, supra note 93.

¹²⁸ See id.

¹²⁹See Viewpoint: 1985 Fast Marked the Beginning of LDS Charities, THE CHURCH OF JESUSCHRISTOFLATTER-DAYSAINTS(Jan. 25, 2015),https://www.churchofjesuschrist.org/church/news/viewpoint-1985-fast-marked-
beginning-of-lds-charities?lang=eng [https://perma.cc/6T4Q-VCK5].Viewpoint-1985-fast-marked-

¹³⁰For a map of international projects headed by LDS Charities, see HumanitarianProjects,LATTER-DAYSAINTCHARITIES,https://lds-gis.maps.arcgis.com/apps/webappviewer/index.html?id=e1e8234a88604e4e8f60d0f68644lac7 (last visited Feb. 14, 2022).

¹³¹ See, e.g., Shelby M. Cullom, *The Menace of Mormonism*, 181 N. AM. REV. 379 (1905); Eugene Young, *Revival of the Mormon Problem*, 168 N. AM. REV. 476, 476–89 (1899); FRANK J. CANNON & HARVEY J. O'HIGGINS, UNDER THE PROPHET IN UTAH: THE NATIONAL MENACE OF A POLITICAL PRIESTCRAFT (1911).

Recently these include Kathleen Flake, the first chair of Mormon studies at the University of Virginia;¹³² Matthew Bowman, a respected Latter-day Saint historian;¹³³ and John G. Turner, a nonmember academic who wrote a thoroughly researched biography of Brigham Young.¹³⁴ Other well-known Latter-day Saint academics include Columbia University history professor Richard Bushman,¹³⁵ author and editor Terryl Givens,¹³⁶ and Patrick Q. Mason, former president of the Mormon History Association and Utah State University Chair of Mormon History and Cultures.¹³⁷

Latter-day Saint academics in other fields of study have generated positive renown by their successes. In the sciences, physicist Harvey Fletcher became known as "the father of stereophonic sound" through his invention of the 2-A audiometer as well as an early electronic hearing aid.¹³⁸ American inventor Philo T. Farnsworth developed the first electric television.¹³⁹ Chemist and former university instructor and graduate school dean Henry Eyring received the Wolf Prize in Chemistry and the National Medal of Science.¹⁴⁰ James E. Talmage was a chemist, geologist, and author, as well as a member of the Quorum of the Twelve Apostles of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints.¹⁴¹ The present-day president of the Church, President Russell

135 See Bushman, Richard, COLUM. UNIV. IN THE CITY OF N.Y. DEP'T OF HISTORY, https://history.columbia.edu/person/bushman-richard/ [https://perma.cc/Y5EZ-HMGC].

136 See TERRYL GIVENS, https://www.terrylgivens.com/ [https://perma.cc/3X6K-GUTS].

137SeePatrickQ.Mason,UTAHSTATEUNIV.,https://chass.usu.edu/history/directory/patrick-mason[https://perma.cc/E882-BL64].

138Harvey Fletcher, BYU's First Physics Graduate Wins a Posthumous Grammy Award, BYU:PHYSICS& ASTRONOMY,https://physics.byu.edu/department/news/26[https://perma.cc/6Y7C-XWV3].

139 See Philo Farnsworth: Electronic Television, LEMELSON-MIT, https://lemelson.mit.edu/resources/philo-farnsworth [https://perma.cc/C9]4-P2UY].

 140
 See
 Remembering
 Henry
 Eyring,
 C&EN,

 https://cen.acs.org/articles/86/i23/Remembering-Henry-Eyring.html
 (WOULD 2007)
 C&EN,

[https://perma.cc/K2LV-L3H6].

¹³² See Kathleen Flake, UVA ARTS & SCIENCES, https://religiousstudies.as.virginia.edu/faculty/profile/kf7dy [https://perma.cc/6VT3-Z29L].

¹³³ See Matthew Bowman, SCH. OF ARTS & HUMANITIES CLAREMONT GRADUATE UNIV., https://www.cgu.edu/people/matthew-bowman/ [https://perma.cc/9W44-XEGX].

¹³⁴ See JOHN G. TURNER, https://johngturner.com/ [https://perma.cc/MD6N-UXHH].

¹⁴¹ See James E. Talmage (1862–1933), THE CHURCH OF JESUS CHRIST OF LATTER-DAY SAINTS, https://abn.churchofjesuschrist.org/study/ensign/2010/03/small-and-simple-things/james-e-talmage-1862-

^{1933?}lang=eng&adobe_mc_ref=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.churchofjesuschrist.org%2Fstudy% 2Fensign%2F2010%2F03%2Fsmall-and-simple-things%2Fjames-e-talmage-1862-

^{1933%3}Flang%3Deng&adobe_mc_sdid=SDID%3D73322318B3E98F78-

M. Nelson, did a post-doctoral study at the University of Minnesota, where he and fellow researchers developed a heart-lung machine that in 1951 supported the first-ever human open-heart surgery.¹⁴²

Other Latter-day Saints whose influence has been pervasive are academics Ann Braude, director of the Women's Studies in Religion Program and senior lecturer on American religious history at Harvard Divinity School;¹⁴³ Harvard historian Laurel Thatcher Ulrich;¹⁴⁴ authors Juanita Brooks,¹⁴⁵ Ann Perry,¹⁴⁶ Martine Leavitt,¹⁴⁷ and Ann Dee Ellis;¹⁴⁸ artists Minerva Teichert,¹⁴⁹ Liz Lemon Swindle,¹⁵⁰ and Caitlin Connolly;¹⁵¹ and musicians Gladys Knight,¹⁵² Ariel Bybee,¹⁵³ and Lindsey Stirling.¹⁵⁴

In fact, many prominent Latter-day Saint scholars also held leadership within the Church as well as prominent posts in higher education, including John A. Widtsoe, who served as director of the Agricultural Experiment Station at Utah State Agricultural College

143 See Ann D. Braude, HARV. DIVINITY SCH., https://hds.harvard.edu/people/ann-d-braude [https://perma.cc/9MLP-PEAX].

144 See Laurel Thatcher Ulrich, SCHOLARS AT HARV., https://scholar.harvard.edu/laurelulrich [https://perma.cc/N7JC-KERJ].

145 See Juanita Brooks, Famed Utah & Mormon Historian, UTAH WOMEN'S HIST., https://www.utahwomenshistory.org/bios/juanita-brooks/ [https://perma.cc/PG2S-J492].

146 See Anne Perry—Her Life, Like Her Stories, Layered with Intrigue, DESERET NEWS (Aug. 29, 1999), https://www.deseret.com/1999/8/29/19463136/anne-perry-her-life-like-her-stories-layered-with-intrigue [https://perma.cc/B88K-E2WB].

147 *See Martine Leavitt*, VT. COLL. OF FINE ARTS, https://vcfa.edu/faculty-staff/martine-leavitt/ [https://perma.cc/M8S5-X2QL].

148 See ANN DEE ELLIS, http://anndeeellis.com/ [https://perma.cc/SAC7-PFVD].

149 See Peter B. Gardner, Painting the Mormon Story, Y MAG. (Winter 2008), https://magazine.byu.edu/article/minerva-teichert/ [https://perma.cc/6U9X-2FEW].

150 See LIZ LEMON SWINDLE, https://lizlemonswindle.com/ [https://perma.cc/TA4T-C3AA].

151 See CAITLIN CONNOLLY, https://www.caitlinconnolly.com/ [https://perma.cc/5TCU-BNEN].

152 See GLADYS KNIGHT, https://gladysknight.com/ [https://perma.cc/2RTW-FEVP].

153 See Danielle Christensen, Friends and Family Remember LDS Opera Singer Ariel Bybee as a 'Beautiful Woman with a Beautiful Heart', DESERET NEWS (Mar. 29, 2018), https://www.deseret.com/2018/3/29/20642541/friends-and-family-remember-lds-operasinger-ariel-bybee-as-a-beautiful-woman-with-a-beautiful-heart [https://perma.cc/75CW-3V23].

154 See LINDSEY STERLING, https://www.lindseystirling.com/ [https://perma.cc/8JUT-37B7].

⁵⁴⁷AD7C04F1E71C3%7CMCORGID%3D66C5485451E56AAE0A490D45%2540AdobeOrg %7CTS%3D1652387533 [https://perma.cc/8GSP-FAMC].

¹⁴² See University of Utah Health Announces New Dr. Russell M. Nelson and Dantzel W. Nelson Presidential Chair in Cardiothoracic Surgery, THE UNIV. OF UTAH (2018), https://giving.utah.edu/imagine/university-of-utah-health-announces-new-dr-russell-mnelson-and-dantzel-w-nelson-presidential-chair-in-cardiothoracic-surgery [https://perma.cc/9XDC-P38U].

and served in the Quorum of the Twelve Apostles,¹⁵⁵ and President Dallin H. Oaks, current First Counselor in the First Presidency of the Church and former BYU president, University of Chicago law professor, and member of the Utah State Supreme Court.¹⁵⁶

CONCLUSION

My thinking about persecution was forever changed when I heard the story of the young Yazidi girl who recognized the man raping her as her family's dentist. This suggests that at times of stress, neighbors who have lived peaceably together can turn upon one another. It also illustrates how "close to home" religious persecution can be. It was in the aftermath of that conference, in reflecting upon the experiences of Latter-day Saints, that I saw in an instant of clarity (a little like a light switch being turned on in a darkened room), that the sources and the solution to persecution are one and the same. Here I have focused on the state, other religious communities, the media, the persecuted themselves, businesses, neighbors, and academics, and the roles they play in both persecution and inclusion.

I concluded with "academics" because I want the implications of the analysis to be personal, since I am an academic who studies law and religion from an international and comparative law perspective. Each of us, and from whichever institutions we inhabit, is capable, intentionally or unconsciously, of being either a part of the problem or part of the solution. My hope is that I will be on the side of those who come to the aid of minorities, including religious minorities, who suffer persecution, just as there were those who came to the aid of my own religious community at a time when we were particularly weak and vulnerable.

widtsoe%3Flang%3Deng&adobe_mc_sdid=SDID%3D3063FA4B4A427B86-

¹⁵⁵ See Elder John A. Widtsoe, THE CHURCH OF JESUS CHRIST OF LATTER-DAY SAINTS, https://abn.churchofjesuschrist.org/study/liahona/2010/02/small-and-simple-things/clder-john-a-

widtsoe?lang=eng&adobe_mc_ref=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.churchofjesuschrist.org%2Fstud y%2Fliahona%2F2010%2F02%2Fsmall-and-simple-things%2Felder-john-a-

⁵D530381678428FF%7CMCORGID%3D66C5485451E56AAE0A490D45%2540AdobeOrg %7CTS%3D1652405124 [https://perma.cc/3DTW-R2JT].

¹⁵⁶ See Dallin H. Oaks, THE CHURCH OF JESUS CHRIST OF LATTER-DAY SAINTS, https://www.churchofjesuschrist.org/learn/dallin-h-oaks?lang=eng [https://perma.cc/7594-QNSA].